

Annex 3 to the Final Report

STAKEHOLDER QUESTIONNAIRE

Berlin/Almaty,
May 16, 2017

Policy review of development of Public
transport sector in Kazakhstan



Annex 3 to the Final Report

prepared by

ETC Transport Consultants GmbH
Martin-Hoffmann-Str. 18
12435 Berlin
Germany

In cooperation with

BDC Consulting
33 Bukhar Zhyrau Blvd.
Almaty 050013
Kazakhstan

BACKGROUND INFORMATION TO THE PROJECT

The UNDP project “City of Almaty Sustainable Transport” Project (CAST) is a GEF-funded urban transport project primarily aiming at

- Reducing CO₂ emissions and air pollution in Almaty and the wider city area,
- Improving Almaty’s public transport management system through capacity building, and
- Establishing Almaty to become the model city of sustainable urban public transportation in Kazakhstan.

The current UNDP project “Policy review of development of Public transport sector in Kazakhstan” aims at realising a comprehensive policy review of the public transport sector in Kazakhstan by building on preceding works as well as subsequent proposals for legislative adjustments to enable the improvement of financing opportunities for enhanced urban transport infrastructure.

As stakeholder engagement and participation are key elements to the successful implementation of sustainable urban public transport projects, one of the very first project steps is to interview relevant stakeholders in order to understand their involvement in and assessment of sustainable public transportation in Kazakhstan.

This way, the consultants and CAST Project Management will be able to understand and evaluate the stakeholders’ assessment of the past, current and future public transport situation in Kazakhstan.

INSTRUCTIONS AND INFORMATION ON QUESTIONNAIRE COMPLETION

Answers will be treated anonymously and evaluation will concentrate solely on the various stakeholder groups not the individual persons’ assessment.

Please complete each section. If the question is unanswerable from your perspective, please indicate this by ticking “unable to answer”.

STAKEHOLDER QUESTIONNAIRE GUIDELINE

A) GENERAL INFORMATION

Information about Stakeholder:

Name of respondent:	
Name of Company:	
Location of Company (City):	

Stakeholder Group (please tick one box):	Local Authority	<input type="checkbox"/>	(Public Transport) Interest Group	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Regulatory Agency	<input type="checkbox"/>	University/Research institution	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Public Transport Company	<input type="checkbox"/>	International Agency	<input type="checkbox"/>
	Private Sector Company (not further specified)	<input type="checkbox"/>	Other.....	<input type="checkbox"/>

To be filled by interviewer

Information about Interviewer:

Name:	
Company:	
Date of Interview:	
Place of Interview:	
Consecutive Number (Code):	

B) STAKEHOLDER'S INVOLVEMENT

B.1	As an introduction to this interview, please elaborate shortly what your role is concerning public transportation in Almaty and/or Kazakhstan!

B.2	Please assess the <u>relevance</u> of the following parameters for <u>promoting sustainable public transportation</u> in Kazakhstan! (one tick per box only)			
Reason	irrelevant (-)	relevant (0)	very relevant (+)	don't know/ no answer
Knowledge Sharing; Cross-learning	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Securing additional funding	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Improving public transport service levels	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Integrate transport and urban planning	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Manage city-wide parking of private vehicles	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Manage inner-city traffic both private and public	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Promote more cycling in and around the city	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Promote low emission car zones in the city	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Link suburban and urban transport	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

B.2	Please assess the relevance of the following parameters for promoting sustainable public transportation in Kazakhstan! (one tick per box only)			
Reason	irrelevant (-)	relevant (0)	very relevant (+)	don't know/ no answer
networks				
Develop road-based transport sustainably	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other: _____ _____ _____	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

C) ASSESSMENT OF THE CURRENT TRANSPORT SITUATION

D.1	Referring to the overall Public Transport Situation in Almaty, how do you assess the following parameters? Please tick one box only.					
	Please rate on a scale from 1 to 5 (1: not satisfying; 5: very good)					
	1 (--)	2 (-)	3 (0)	4 (+)	5 (++)	Unable to answer
Overall Transport Offer (capacity)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Offer of different transport modes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Frequency of services provided	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Fares/Price structure	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ease of interchanging	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Available timetable information	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Quality of bus stops/termini	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Drivers/staff P/T service knowledge	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Speed of transport	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

offer						
Comfort of travel	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Punctuality of services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Further comments:						

D.2	In your opinion, what are the most important issues for satisfactory Public Transport Services <u>to passengers</u> ? Please tick one box only. Please rate on a scale from 1 to 5 (1: not important; 5: very important)					
	1 (--)	2 (-)	3 (0)	4 (+)	5 (++)	Unable to answer
Affordability (Ticketing Price)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Transparency of ticketing structure	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Frequency of services offered	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Diversity of transport modes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Comfort of travel	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Spatial coverage of transport network	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ease of changing mode/service	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Availability and accessibility of pre-trip timetables	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Availability and accessibility of on-trip information	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Driver friendliness/approachability	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Travel Speed	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Personal safety at	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

D.2	In your opinion, what are the most important issues for satisfactory Public Transport Services to passengers? Please tick one box only. Please rate on a scale from 1 to 5 (1: not important; 5: very important)					
	1 (--)	2 (-)	3 (0)	4 (+)	5 (++)	Unable to answer
stops/on board						
Punctuality of service	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Room for wheelchairs/ strollers	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Accessibility for disabled/elderly	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Further comments:						

D.4	Do you see the need for additional public transport services to be provided in Kazakhstan?	
	Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>
	Please elaborate:	Please elaborate:

D.5	Is individual motorized traffic (private cars, motorcycles, etc.) currently more attractive than public transportation?	
	Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>
	Why?	Why?

D) ASSESSMENT OF FUTURE PUBLIC TRANSPORT SITUATION

D.1	From your point of view, which issues <u>should be addressed</u> in the <u>future</u> regarding the development of sustainable public transportation in Kazakhstan? (<u>one</u> tick per box only)			
Expectations	Not important (-)	medium importance (0)	Very important (+)	don't know/ no answer
Development of pilot projects ¹	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Driver efficiency training (lower fuel consumption)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Greater public awareness of walking and cycling	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Initiating better construction standards	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Lowering GHG emissions caused by cars/traffic	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Increasing modal split for public transport	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Traffic-related noise reduction in urban areas	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Developing an integrated public transport system	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
New policies regarding public transportation	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other:	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

¹ For example: Light tram line, Bus Rapid Transit, new transport demand model and cost-benefit analysis, new city master plan

E.2	How do you think will the following aspects develop by 2030 with continued efforts to promote and work towards a sustainable, accessible and affordable public transport network in Kazakhstan? Please rate your perceived change by ticking one box only.					
Situation for..... in 2030	strong decline (--)	moderate decline (-)	Status Quo (0)	moderate increase (+)	strong increase (++)	don't know/ no answer
Public awareness of transport-related problems	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Quality of inner-city living/working	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Greenhouse Gas Emissions	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Car-induced congestion	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Road fatalities	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Private car ownership levels	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Number of inner-city parking spaces	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Operation of new P/T vehicles	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Revenue generated from parking fees	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Revenue generated from P/T services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Length of bus rapid transit network	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Length of cycle route network	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Other:	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

E) PUBLIC TRANSPORT FINANCING

E.1	Please elaborate in your own words the current situation in <u>public transport financing</u> in Almaty and / or Kazakhstan!

E.2	From your point of view, is it necessary to <u>reform</u> the current public transport financing system in Kazakhstan?	
	Yes <input type="checkbox"/>	No <input type="checkbox"/>
	Please elaborate:	Please elaborate:

E.3	Please assess the following statements regarding public transport financing:		
	I agree	I don't agree	Unable to answer
Public transportation should receive <u>more government subsidies</u> .	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Public transportation should be <u>financed 100% from government subsidies</u> .	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Public transportation should be <u>solely financed through tickets and revenues</u> .	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Public transportation should be <u>privatized</u> entirely.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Public transportation should be financed by <u>both subsidies and revenues</u> .	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Public transport projects should be <u>PPP financed</u> .	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Public transportation needs to stay <u>affordable</u> for the average income user.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

E.3	Please assess the following statements regarding public transport financing:		
	I agree	I don't agree	Unable to answer
There is the need for specific <u>public transport financing policies</u> in Kazakhstan and Kazakh cities.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Open answer:			

F) PUBLIC TRANSPORT ORGANISATION

F.1	Please elaborate in your own words how public transportation is currently organised?

F.2	Please assess the following statements regarding public transport organisation:		
	I agree	I don't agree	Unable to answer
Public transport organisation is currently <u>too diversified</u> .	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<u>One institution</u> should organise all public transportation in Almaty.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
There is need for organised public transportation <u>tender systems</u> .	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
The various <u>bus companies</u> should be organised and represented by an interest group.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

F.2	Please assess the following statements regarding public transport organisation:		
	I agree	I don't agree	Unable to answer
There should be one <u>city-wide ticketing system</u> in Kazakh cities.	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
There should be more <u>coordinated public transportation</u> in cooperation with <u>alternative forms</u> (e.g. bicycles, carsharing, ...)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Open answer:			

G) PUBLIC TRANSPORT POLICIES

G.1	Please assess the following statements regarding public transport policies:		
	I agree	I don't agree	Unable to answer
There is need for specific policies in terms of ...	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<u>Safety and security</u> in public transportation	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Public transport <u>contracts</u>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<u>Ticketing and Revenues</u>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<u>Quality</u> of services provided	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<u>Procurement</u> of Public transport services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<u>Subsidised financing</u> of Public Transport Services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<u>General financing</u> of Public Transportation	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

G.1	Please assess the following statements regarding public transport policies:		
	I agree	I don't agree	Unable to answer
Open answer:			

H) SUGGESTIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

F.1	Do you have explicit <u>suggestions/project ideas/ etc.</u> for improving of public transportation in Kazakhstan regarding the following criteria?	
	Type of Transport Mode	
	Frequency & Speed	
	Number of Lines / Stops	
	Interconnections of various Public Transport Lines/Bus Companies/...	
	Ticketing	
	Punctuality	
	Technical Equipment	
	Sustainability	
	Relationship between Public Transportation and	

	Individual Motorized Traffic (private cars)	
	Organizational Form of Public Transportation	
	Financing Concepts	